

**ULSTER COUNTY RESOURCE RECOVERY AGENCY
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING
AUGUST 24, 2020**

The Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency held a Regular Board Meeting on August 24, 2020. This meeting was at the Agency's Main Office located at 999 Flatbush Road, Kingston, NY 12401. There was also a call-in audio option available through Webex.

The proceedings were convened at 12:00pm.

The following Board members were present: Chair Fred Wadnola, Vice Chair Katherine Beinkafner, Treasurer Charles Landi, Member JoAnne Myers, and Member Lisa Mitten.

Also present were: Counsel/Secretary Kenneth Gilligan, Acting Executive Director/Controller Tim DeGraff, Director of Operations and Safety Charlie Whittaker, Recycling Coordinator Angelina Peone, Recycling Educator Melinda France; Administrative Assistant Brenna Whitaker was absent.

From the public: Reporter Bill Kemble from the Daily Freeman.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

PUBLIC COMMENT

Manna Jo Greene asked Fred Wadnola if he would prefer she make her comments on Resolution No. 2515 during public comment.

Fred Wadnola responded that yes, she should do it now.

Manna Jo Greene stated that she read over the resolution, and she does think it is a valuable state of vision, but she doesn't think it has a great enough urgency and is more aspirational than implementable and fails to address the need for the Agency to work collaboratively with the Legislature, Recycling Oversight Committee, other relevant county departments, and knowledgeable community members to collectively develop a zero waste implementation plan that is both visionary and realistic and can be implemented alongside the LSWMP. She added that there is little recognition for the need to clearly define a timeline with specific goals. She also stated that it does not acknowledge the ongoing work of the Recycling Oversight Committee to create the Zero Waste Implementation Plan as requested by the Legislature, the Solid Waste Planning Commission, and the Energy & Environment Committee. She said that there is a climate crisis going on, and they need to work together to be most effective. She said this deficit can be remedied by acknowledging the work on the Zero Waste Implementation Plan being done by the Recycling Oversight Committee and to add a section that states that the Agency will work collaboratively with that process and with the Legislature and other departments. She added that the NYSDEC legal department has advised the Legislature that they need a SEQRA determination before taking action on the LSWMP and that it is a type one action. She said that the Legislature follows the state's guidance on that, as well as seeking lead agency status. She stated that the Agency also has the right to seek lead agency status, but she worries that will slow down the process.

CHAIR'S COMMENTS

Fred Wadnola thanked the Zero Waste Committee and Angelina Peone for the hard work they did in developing the zero waste resolution. He also thanked Tim DeGraff and Charlie Whittaker for completing multiple projects that were put on the back burner by the previous Executive Director, including the new blacktop at the MRF and new concrete pads for the compost area which is being done in-house with a substantial cost savings.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Charles Landi stated that he wanted to make a correction to Katherine Beinkafner's comments on page 7. He said that the map of ninety-three 200 acre parcels was generated by the Real Property Tax Service Agency's director Thomas Jackson specifically for the Agency, and was never confidential. He stated that tax maps are public record, and the significance of 200 acres is that at 20 feet deep with Ulster County's waste stream of 133,000 tons per year, a landfill that size would last 75 years. He continued that the map went on to the Solid Waste Management Improvement Committee, where the DEC eliminated 76 of the parcels for environmental reasons leaving 17 to be evaluated. He said he wants the minutes changed to replace Katherine's comments with this information.

Katherine Beinkafner responded that the original maps were generated by Steven Parisio, who built a geographic information system that they used as a demonstration on how to site a landfill. She said she had thought that Charles Landi's map came from there. She said that Steven Parisio's maps were confidential, because they did not want the public to think they would be building a landfill on their property.

Tim DeGraff said that Charles Landi's correction of Katherine Beinkafner's comments would have to go into the notes for today's Board Meeting. Since the minutes are a transcript of what was said during the meeting, they are correct.

Ken Gilligan agreed and said it should be added to the file for today's meeting.

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve the minutes of the July 28, 2020 Regular Board Meeting. Seconded by JoAnne Myers.

Roll Call Vote

Wadnola: Aye
Beinkafner: Abstain
Landi: Aye
Myers: Aye
Mitten: Aye

The motion passed 4-0.

COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

Fred Wadnola stated that the next Regular Board Meeting will be held on September 28, 2020 at 12:00pm.

JoAnne Myers stated that the meeting cannot be held that day as it's Yom Kippur.

Tim DeGraff recommended doing the next meeting directly after the Public Hearing which is on October 5 at 12:00pm.

JoAnne Myers cautioned the Board to be mindful of different holidays when scheduling meetings.

Angelina Peone said that the Agency has been selected for funding in the 2021 community grants program which is an initiative by the Pollution Prevention Institute. The Agency will be awarded \$18,270 to support a zero waste seminar project in 2021, which will include a series of educational events and a campaign celebrating Plastic Free July with the goal of raising awareness of diversion practices that reduce waste and optimize the reuse of materials, specifically around single use plastics. The grant program will fund 100% of expenses related to teaching tools, as well as 25% personnel costs in the second quarter of 2021. The team has built partnerships to work in this project with Riverkeeper, Cornell Cooperative Extension, Repair Café, SUNY New Paltz Office of Sustainability, Woodstock Land Conservancy, Saugerties Library, Woodstock Bring Your Own, New Paltz Climate Action Coalition, Climate Smart Gardiner, and the Stone Ridge Library.

RECYCLING PROGRAM UPDATE

Angelina Peone presented the Board with a summary for the month of August. She stated the focus for the month is textile recycling. She gave the following information regarding the issues around textiles:

- It is estimated that Americans generate 16,000,000 tons of textile waste per year.
- About 95% of this material is recoverable, however only 15% is being recycling currently.
- The EPA estimates that about 10% of municipal solid waste generated in the US is fabric, clothing, shoes, and other textiles.
- Textiles comprise the fourth largest material component buried in landfills. The first is food waste, followed by plastics, then paper.
- 1.4 billion pounds of textiles are thrown out in New York State alone every year.
- The average New Yorker throws away about 70 pounds of textiles per year.
- According to the Agency's survey results from 2019, in Ulster County approximately 1,091 tons of textiles were recovered for the purpose of reuse and recycling.
- According to NYSAR3 and the Council for Textile Recycling, the impact of these commodities was \$130,000,000 in economic value and that over 1,000 jobs could be created in New York State if better infrastructure were in place for textile recycling.

Melinda France explained that a lot of people do not realize that textiles include clothing, belts, purses, shoes, socks, blankets, sheets, shower curtains, Halloween costumes, and sports jerseys, as long as they are not wet or contain mold or mildew.

She said that before using textile bins, there are many ways to reuse or repurpose old textiles. She showed the Board a blanket that was made out of her daughter’s old t-shirts as well as a shopping bag made from an old t-shirt. She continued that textiles can be recycled into many different things, including carpet padding and insulation. She said repair is also a good first step, and the Hudson Valley Repair Café can teach individuals how to repair their items. She also recommended re-gifting, clothing swaps.

Angelina Peone noted that the Agency has textile boxes located in the parking lot for the public to use.

Fred Wadnola commented that the SPCA takes towels and sheets for the animals in the shelter.

Melinda France said that they just added their recycling commercials to the Agency’s phone system so they will be heard while callers are on hold. She also pointed out the produce bags, backpacks, and reusable straws that the Agency just purchased to give out to the public.

Charles Landi stated that textiles need to be treated with chemicals to make them fire proof if they are to become insulation.

Melinda France said that is correct. The textile companies first extract usable items, then the rest is shredded, washed and treated.

Lisa Mitten said that she appreciates the format of this report.

Melinda France responded that the Board should let them know if they would like them to cover a certain topic at a meeting.

GENERAL REPORTS

Tim DeGraff presented the MSW and Recycling Tonnage reports:

MSW

	July 2020		
	Target Tonnage	Actual Tonnage	Difference
MSW	12,464 tons	13,179 tons	715 tons
Sludge	315 tons	322 tons	7 tons

Recycling Tonnage

	July 2020	July 2019
Commingle	133.65 tons	118.76 tons
Glass	88.33 tons	46.22 tons
Mixed News	103.85 tons	109.44 tons
Kingston City Hard Mix	97.93 tons	106.6 tons
OCC	229.34 tons	178.48 tons
Food Waste	474.63 tons	430.18 tons

Recycling Market Update

Charlie Whittaker reported that fiber is no longer a negative number, and the Agency is now receiving some revenue from the hard mix, and the Agency is not paying to get rid of mixed news. He said that there has been no change in cardboard prices, nor has he heard of change coming. He said that currently the Agency is sending fiber to Canada and Westchester County. He continued that the Agency has not had to pay for glass since July. He said HDPE and PETE are still very low, and natural is still very high due to a large demand.

Fred Wadnola asked where the Agency is sending glass.

Charlie Whittaker responded that the Agency is doing a shared service with Greene County, meaning the Agency is taking their commingled recyclables and Greene County is taking the Agency's glass for a beneficial use such as road repair.

Lisa Mitten asked if this glass is just from the Town Transfer Stations.

Charlie Whittaker responded that yes, it only includes glass from the Town Transfer Stations, because the MRF glass contains too much garbage.

Lisa Mitten and JoAnne Myers asked about the missing commodities report.

Tim DeGraff reminded them that he had spoken about it at the previous meeting. He said he decided to remove it due to it being an ineffective internal control due to it being voted on a month after the fact. He stated that the new method of reporting happens in real time and is a much better method of internal control.

Charlie Whittaker added that the previous report did not accurately represent the price the Agency sold a material for.

Tim DeGraff agreed, saying that the Agency is sometimes offered a price that then changes the next week, but that old report only represented the first price.

JoAnne Myers asked who is transporting glass to Greene County and who is responsible for the cost.

Charlie Whittaker answered that Greene County picks up the Agency's glass, and their commingled and fiber recycling gets picked up by the Agency. He said there have not been any loads for the Agency to pick up at this point.

Lisa Mitten asked if this process is new.

Charlie Whittaker responded that it has been in the works for about three months, but the process is new.

Katherine Beinkafner stated that her concern would be that the trucks would be running empty half of the time if the Agency is driving up to Athens to drop off glass, and Greene County is driving here to drop off commingled and fiber recycling.

Charlie Whittaker said this is still a new arrangement and details are still being worked out, but that Katherine Beinkafner's question was a good one. He said that due to the details of how much Greene County had per load, it made more sense for the Agency to put a trailer up there.

Lisa Mitten asked the net cost of this arrangement to the Agency.

Tim DeGraff responded that it is still too early to calculate that.

Charlie Whittaker stated that in July, the Agency paid \$7,100 to get rid of glass, and now Greene County is taking it in exchange for their recycling which is marketable, even though it isn't making a lot of money. He said he can't see any negative points to the arrangement and doesn't see a cost in the future but it is still too early to tell.

Tim DeGraff said that they plan to isolate a load to get an idea of what exactly is in the commingled recycling so that they can estimate possible revenues.

Fred Wadnola noted that when the Agency was created it only handled solid waste, because the towns wanted to keep the revenue from recycling. He said that once the markets dried up, there was no more revenue.

FINANCIAL MATTERS

Tim DeGraff presented the July 2020 Treasurer's Report and MRF Cost Center Analysis.

Treasurer's Report

For the month of July, the Agency's MSW tons were 9,239 and C&D tons were 3,940. Revenue line item of note: Grant revenues in the amount of \$32,902 is for fourth quarter 2019 and first quarter 2020 MWRR grant payment. Total revenue for the month of \$1,574,636. Expense line items of note: CLF monitoring & maintenance includes \$10,568 for electrical repairs at NPLF and UCLF over several months. Total expenses for the month of \$1,226,243. Net operating revenue was \$348,393. Capital Outlay includes \$8,889 for a new VMF supply shed, \$113,893 for first progressive billing for the scale project, and \$29,070 for the compost expansion project. For the month of July, the fund balance was a positive \$196,541. Year to Date fund balance is a deficit of \$1,753,504 (exclusive of operating reserve transfer in, a deficit of \$2,076,979).

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve the July 2020 Treasurer's Report. Moved by Charles Landi and seconded by JoAnne Myers.

Roll Call Vote

Wadnola: Aye
Beinkafner: Aye
Landi: Aye
Myers: Aye
Mitten: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

MRF Cost Center Analysis

For the month of July, tipping fees were \$0. The total sale of recyclables was \$41,401. Total transport/disposal costs for July were \$9,596. Total personnel expenses were \$41,124. Total operating expenses were \$7,944. Total personnel/operating costs were \$49,068. Net loss for the month of \$17,263. Year-to-date net loss of \$207,359.

ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

Resolution No. 2512 RE: Authorization of Draft 2021 Agency Budget

JoAnne Myers asked how many years it has been since the Agency raised the tipping fee.

Tim DeGraff replied that it went up last year from \$103/ton to \$105/ton, the first time it was raised in six years.

Fred Wadnola said the Agency hasn't asked the County for a net service fee in eight years.

Tim DeGraff said that the major goal this year was to not raise the tipping fee. He stated that the only thing that could change this would be the results of the upcoming sludge transportation and disposal bids.

He made the following notes regarding the budget and went over the key budget highlights, which are attached.

Lisa Mitten asked if any of the money budgeted for consultants is part of what was listed in the LSWMP.

Tim DeGraff answered that part of it is, but it is a combination professional services such as auditor costs, Ken Gilligan's fees, website and IT consultants, and other general engineering costs.

Lisa Mitten asked if that means that the plans called for in the LSWMP are not budgeted for.

Tim DeGraff responded that the budgeted amount is all of the costs grouped together from prior year actuals, but the plan is that some of that cost will go toward the LSWMP.

Lisa Mitten asked why overtime wages have significantly increased over the years.

Tim DeGraff said that relates to an increased volume over the years, without an increased workforce. He stated that Charlie Whittaker works with a small staff and when the floor needs to be cleaned off, that means staff stays late to get it done.

JoAnne Myers asked if Covid-19 was a factor in this.

Tim DeGraff responded that no, this has been going on for the past three to four years.

Charlie Whittaker added that now the Agency is doing e-waste collection on Saturdays which is all overtime. He said that all of the diversion happening while still needing to clean the floors off adds to

overtime as well. He added that he helps with pulling items out of the transfer station as well to help keep things moving.

Fred Wadnola stated that it is more cost effective to pay current employees overtime rather than hire more employees that may not always having something to do, and have to pay benefits for them. He said this also gives the employees a chance to make a little more money which they appreciate.

Charlie Whittaker said that he would not compromise the safety of the employees by pushing them to get certain things done during their regular schedule.

JoAnne Myers asked Tim DeGraff if there is a way to separate recycling education and composting.

Tim DeGraff answered that he can do that.

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve Resolution No. 2512 RE: Authorization of Draft 2021 Agency Budget. Seconded by Charles Landi.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye

Landi: Aye

Myers: Aye

Mitten: Aye

Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

Resolution No. 2513 RE: Approving the 2021 Draft Agency Capital Plan

Tim DeGraff stated that \$250,000 was budgeted for Capital Outlay. He said over the past five years, and particularly this year the Agency has spent a lot of money.

He said he has budgeted for a new tanker for leachate.

Charlie Whittaker said that they won't be getting rid of the current tanker, but keeping it to use as a second machine. He said it is always important to have two of everything.

Tim DeGraff said he also budgeted for two new dump trailers, which is contingent on how the sludge bids go, because they Agency may be able to transport its own sludge.

Fred Wadnola stated that to haul sludge, aluminum trailers are required. He said the steel trailers the Agency has would not work.

JoAnne Myers asked if this would require an additional CDL driver.

Charlie Whittaker responded that the Agency is already down one CDL driver at the moment, and if this goes forward they may need two additional drivers but he isn't going to think too much into it yet.

Charles Landi asked why there is nothing in the budget regarding improving the MRF.

Tim DeGraff responded that there is a section in the budget for the MRF, which includes improvements such as new cylinders that have already been ordered. There are also planned improvements for 2022 and 2023.

Charlie Whittaker said that they don't plan to make any major changes to the MRF due to the small size of the operation.

Charles Landi asked if the tonnage would go up if the quality of the product produced was higher.

Charlie Whittaker said that the MRF already makes a quality product, of which 95% comes from the Town Transfer Stations. He said that the employees do an amazing job separating items, but that the main problem is moisture in the cardboard which cannot be fixed by improvements to the MRF.

Charles Landi asked when the last significant improvement was made to the MRF.

Charlie Whittaker responded that money and improvements are constantly being put into the MRF to keep it running effectively.

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve Resolution No. 2513 RE: Approving the 2021 Draft Agency Capital Plan. Moved by Charles Landi, seconded by JoAnne Myers.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye

Landi: Aye

Myers: Aye

Mitten: Aye

Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

Resolution No. 2514 RE: Authorizing and Approving the Draft for 2021 Tipping Fees and Other Charges

Tim DeGraff explained that the fee schedule design was completely revamped this year. He added that some of the charges listed haven't increased over the years, while the charge to the Agency to dispose those items has risen, so some fees have increased for 2021. He stated that florescent bulbs, tires, and mattress/box spring charges will be changing.

Charles Landi asked why the charge for the grinder isn't listed.

Tim DeGraff answered that the fee schedule is for customers coming across the scale, so it's not necessary to add it. Also, the price for grinding services is not changing.

Fred Wadnola said the grinder is usually a shared service with municipalities.

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve Resolution No. 2514 RE: Authorizing and Approving the Draft for 2021 Tipping Fees and Other Charges. Moved by JoAnne Myers, seconded by Charles Landi.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye

Landi: Aye

Myers: Aye

Mitten: Aye

Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

Resolution No. 2515 RE: Approving Zero Waste Vision for UCRRA

Charles Landi asked Manna Jo Greene when the LSWMP will move out of committee and to the floor for consideration.

Manna Jo Greene replied that the attorney checked first with Region 3 and then with DEC Legal. She said that DEC Legal told the legislature that they have to do a SEQRA determination.

Ken Gilligan told Charles Landi that his question is unnecessary. He said that it is not related to the resolution before the board, and no questions are to be asked that are not about the resolution.

Charles Landi said he will accept that.

Manna Jo Greene attempted to finish answering Charles Landi's previous question.

Ken Gilligan interrupted her, stating that the question is not before her anymore and is not for an outsider to answer.

Charles Landi told Ken Gilligan to be careful, and that he is treading on a situation that may be a problem. He said all he did was ask a question about where the plan was.

Fred Wadnola said that that answer to the question is that it is on hold, being held up by the Energy & Environment Committee. He added that he has two emails from DEC saying that the Agency does not require SEQRA, while David Gordon is claiming that it's required. He said that this will have to be resolved by the attorneys.

He asked if any Board Members had comments on the resolution. He said that the Zero Waste Committee spent hours on it and did a fantastic job.

JoAnne Myers said that she wanted to recognize the recycling team for their work, and highlighted the fact that the Agency already is engaging in a lot of zero waste practices.

Lisa Mitten said that recently she has realized how closely the EPA's definition of zero waste is tied with the Agency's mission statement. She recommended adding the Agency's mission statement to the first or second section of the resolution.

JoAnne Myers agreed, saying she thinks that would make the resolution stronger.

Lisa Mitten read the Agency's mission statement, which is: "Our mission is to protect public health and the environment and to promote sustainable materials management practices in Ulster County by efficiently managing solid waste materials with a focus on resource conservation."

Lisa Mitten moved to add the Agency's mission statement as a second whereas clause of the resolution. Seconded by JoAnne Myers.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye
Landi: Aye
Myers: Aye
Mitten: Aye
Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

Fred Wadnola motioned to approve Resolution No. 2515 RE: Approving Zero Waste Vision for UCRRA. Seconded by Charles Landi.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye
Landi: Aye
Myers: Aye
Mitten: Aye
Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.

OLD BUSINESS

Charlie Whittaker explained that the inbound scale was the first to be replaced, and currently the MRF scale is being replaced. He said that the concrete just came in, and by the end of this week they should be able to start putting the scale together, however there may be a slight delay due to having to put concrete on the other side of the blacktop to allow traffic to go through. He said that the final scale to be replaced will be the outbound scale. He said that everything is coming out wonderfully.

JoAnne Myers stated that the Governance Committee has met and will be meeting again. She said they are looking at what the Agency needs in a potential Executive Director or management team.

Fred Wadnola stated that there should be a Special Meeting of the Board to discuss the Governance Committee's meeting.

The Board scheduled a Special Meeting for Monday, August 31, 2020 at 10:15am

NEW BUSINESS

Tim DeGraff stated that the bid opening for sludge disposal services is scheduled for September 2. He said that once that is done, staff will put together the bid documents for transport services and the opening for that bid will be September 23. He said that he expects to have everything ready for the Board to vote on at the October 5 meeting.

Charles Whittaker told the Board that he thinks that the HHW event should be canceled because of the large amount of residents and staff from multiple groups working together. He stated that if the Board does decide to go through with the event, he will not be able to work it due to having a compromised immune system. He said he worries for other staff as well having to make the decision to work the event when it could endanger their health.

Tim DeGraff agreed, saying that he worries what would happen if someone was to get sick from attending the event. He said that it would be better to be safe than sorry.

Melinda France said that she and Angelina Peone are greeting every single vehicle that comes in, and have everyone check in on their clipboard.

Angelina Peone agreed with Melinda France, stating that there are multiple points of contact between staff and residents during the event that are required. She added that even though the policy is that residents stay in their vehicle, it is very common for people to still get out of their cars. She said that if Charlie Whittaker, who is the Director of Safety, believes that the Agency cannot safely hold the event then she agrees with him.

Melinda France says that they do their best to provide residents with other disposal options when possible.

The Board collectively agreed to cancel the event due to concerns about Covid-19.

Fred Wadnola told Tim DeGraff to notify Clean Harbors and the DEC of the cancelation.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Fred Wadnola moved to enter Executive Session for the purpose of town contract discussion. Seconded by Charles Landi.

The Board exited Executive Session.

ADJOURN

Fred Wadnola motioned to adjourn the August 24, 2020 Regular Board Meeting. Seconded by Charles Landi, seconded by Lisa Mitten. 5 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 absent.

Roll Call Vote

Beinkafner: Aye

Landi: Aye
Myers: Aye
Mitten: Aye
Wadnola: Aye

The motion passed 5-0.


October 5, 2020


Motion to approve the above transcribed Minutes of the August 24 Regular Board Meeting was made by Fred Wadnola, moved by JoAnne Myers and seconded by Charles Landi. 5 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 absent. Absent: N/A


The minutes were approved by the Board.

Transcribed by: Brenna Whitaker, Administrative Assistant. Meetings are recorded and available upon request.

Signatures:


Fred Wadnola, Chair


Ken Gilligan, Secretary


Brenna Whitaker, Administrative Assistant