

**ULSTER COUNTY RESOURCE RECOVERY AGENCY  
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR BOARD MEETING  
JANUARY 24, 2022**

The Ulster County Resource Recovery Agency held a Regular Board Meeting on January 24, 2022. This meeting was held virtually only via Webex.

The proceedings were convened at 12:24 PM.

The following Board members were present: Chair Katherine Beinkafner, Vice Chair JoAnne Myers (arrived at 12:30 PM), Treasurer Charles Landi, Member Lisa Mitten, and Member Tom Kacandes.

Also present were: Counsel/Secretary Kenneth Gilligan, Executive Director/Controller Tim DeGraff, Director of Operations and Compliance Charlie Whittaker, Director of Sustainability Angelina Brandt, and Office Manager Melinda France.

From the public: Reporter Bill Kemble from the Daily Freeman, Reporter Brian Hubert from Hudson Valley One News, Reporter Hank Gross from Mid-Hudson News, Ulster County Legislator Manna Jo Greene, Ulster County Legislator Phil Erner, and Ulster County Comptroller March Gallagher.

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Phil Erner, Ulster County Legislator, City of Kingston, District 6 introduced himself to the Board. He stated he will be working with the Energy and Environment Committee and looks forward to working with UCRRA. He has a background in farming and physics.

The Board invited Mr. Erner for a tour of UCRRA.

**CHAIR'S COMMENTS**

None.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Lisa Mitten motioned to approve the minutes of the December 27, 2021 Regular Board Meeting. Seconded by JoAnne Myers. 5 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 absent. The motion was approved.

**COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

A Regular Board Meeting is scheduled for February 28, 2022 at 12:00 PM. The board voted 5 to 0 to approve the next board meeting date due to the fact that the date is not the third Monday which was voted on in the Annual Organizational Meeting.

**RECYCLING OUTREACH TEAM PROGRAM UPDATE**

Angelina Brandt provided the update. Included in the Board update Angelina provided the Board with a year-end report of the Recycling Outreach Department for last year.

Angelina advised the board that she has given the recycling program update a new look for the year. She stated the format still has all the same information provided in the past just a slightly different layout with a few new things added.

Angelina stated the monthly outreach goal in January was to supplement statewide initiatives that inform the public about new materials management laws being implemented including the Expanded Polystyrene Foam Ban and the local and state organics recycling laws.

Angelina provided the board with the year in review summary and some highlights of the year. The summary/highlights included:

- Recycling Outreach Team completed all the tasks in the work plan for 2021.
- Angelina and Melinda engaged in a total of 19 public speaking events/workshops, conducted 18 facility tours of UCRRA, held 1 special event (the Spring Compost Bin & Rain Barrel Sale) and also completed 3 site visits/consultations to improve local recycling and composting programs.
- Direct engagement/impact of the classes and tours reached 576 adult participants and 138 youth, for a total of 50.5 hours of public speaking engagements. All this information is tracked throughout the year.

The summary in the Board packet provided the total reviews of the annual impact of the newsletters, social media, print and radio advertising campaigns, and showed the suite of new media resources printed over the year; which included media printed in Spanish.

Angelina stated that from now until March she is focused on completing all the recycling compliance reports and planning the household hazardous waste events.

Angelina added that there are 19 program requests in queue for the Spring. She has prepared new program tracking measures to further document the program's reach and help evaluate the success of the program. She stated that the Board will see some of that program tracking cross over on the Recycling Program Update.

Angelina stated that over the years she has presented information about the overall status of all the projects for that month and also have done a deep dive into a specific topic or message for the month. She asked the Board for comments and feedback on what they would like to hear from her during the Recycling Program Update. No comments were made from the Board regarding the recycling program update presentation.

Katherine Beinkafner asked if there were plans for another compost bin sale this year. Angelina responded that it is motion. Brand Builders, who the Agency has partnered with, is working on the website and everything should be ready to launch by mid-February.

## **GENERAL REPORTS**

Tim DeGraff presented the December general reports.

### **MSW Report**

Tim stated that not much changed from the year to December. MSW and C&D tonnage ended up 11% over budget. Sludge was off by 338 tons from the target tons due to waste water MSW being removed

from the sludge prior to being sent to Rockland to be composted. He stated overall December stayed consistent with the rest of the year. In total over 148,000 tons. He stated that is the highest volume that the Agency has taken in and transferred since Flow Control was put in place. He thanked Charlie Whittaker and his staff for keeping the garbage moving and for keeping the floors cleaned every night.

### **Recycling Report**

Tim stated that comparative to last year commingled, glass, mixed news, hard mix from City of Kingston and OCC was pretty consistent. Food waste was down 27% from the prior year. He noted a majority of the recycling in the county doesn't come to UCRRA because of the commercial haulers. Tim noted that even though the volume was up with MSW and C&D; the marketable recycling streams didn't see the same correlation.

JoAnne Myers asked if the Agency keeps track of how much recycling the private haulers do.

Tim responded that Angelina collects the information with the annual recycling report that she gathers each year. The numbers she receives are unaudited numbers and are solely relying on what the haulers provide the Agency.

Angelina added to Tim's response. She stated that she surveys the haulers on an annual basis for any type of recycling, not just the regulated recyclable materials, but any other types of recyclable commodities throughout the year. She stated that it's pretty consistent that the Agency see less than 20% of the counties overall recycling. She stated that also fluctuates with single stream changes. She stated the reporting is in discretion of what the haulers report. She believes the local recycling law could be strengthened and the level of information that the haulers are required to provide, include supporting documentation. She stated that since that material doesn't come to the Agency, the Agency has to have scrutiny with what the number means.

JoAnne Myers asked about the haulers throwing some of the recycling in the MSW.

Angelina added that single stream recycling can be highly contaminated and certain reports she has read in the industry states more than 20% contamination is seen in single stream. She thinks haulers argue that the recycling is too contaminated to process and to sort out and so it could be possibly be thrown out. Also, it can be bagged with other garbage.

Charlie Whittaker commented to JoAnne Myers' question, that single stream is very difficult to spot when it is mixed in with trash. He stated it is hard to say if it is the hauler or the customer who is mixing it and there is no control over it. Charlie stated it has been a problem for a long time and he thinks a lot the recycling is going to the landfill. He believes if the County was not a single stream county and that there were a little bit of strength in the enforcement of recycling with the haulers when they put in for their permits, it would give the Agency better leverage.

JoAnne Myers asked if this issue should be taken on by the County Legislature. Charlie Whittaker stated it would need to go through the lawmakers to make any changes and the Agency does not have the authority to tell the haulers what to do.

Charlie Whittaker talked about the cost savings the haulers believe they are saving by collecting single stream recycling.

JoAnne Myers believes that more education needs to be done for the residents. Charlie Whittaker stated that the Agency has a good product due to the Agency's education and how the Agency works with the Towns.

Tom Kacandes proposed that the Board draft and send a letter copying the County Executive and Chair of the Ulster County Legislature, proposing that single stream recycling be eliminated in the county. Tom Kacandes stated that single stream recycling is totally an unproductive exercise. He continued to state that there is a tremendous amount of materials being wasted, excessive trucking, and that it is an excessive expense for the Agency. He stated single stream recycling has been thoroughly tried and has failed in jurisdictions across the United States. He stated this is very well documented and Charlie Whittaker did a great job on summarizing some of the issues. Tom Kacandes continued to state that from his own experience in private hauling the only thing that will change the situation is for the law to be changed, for paper and cardboard be kept separate/dry from other materials, and education. He believes the letter should say if the County doesn't stop accepting single stream recycling, it will be impossible for the Agency to meet the solid waste management plan's goals.

Charlie Whittaker added haulers know there is a cost for recycling because of it going to the landfill and contamination.

Ken Gilligan added the letter should also be addressed to the Environmental Committee as well. Tom Kacandes amended his request to include every member of the legislature individually.

Katherine Beinkafner asked if the haulers could bring their recycling to the town transfer stations. Charlie Whittaker stated the town transfer stations are set-up for residents only and that is per the DEC regulations.

Charlie Whittaker stated what the Agency gave each Town, giving \$500,000 plus \$40,000 to build up the town transfer stations and close their landfills.

JoAnne Myers and Lisa Mitten support the motion to send a letter.

### **FINANCIAL MATTERS**

Tim DeGraff stated this Treasurer's Report will not be voted on at this meeting. An updated Treasurer's Report for December will be voted on at the next meeting. He stated three weeks for year-end close doesn't give him enough time to get all the invoices in. He likes to give at least 30 days' year-end close before formally closing the books.

#### **Treasurer's Report**

For the month of December the Agency's MSW tons were 8,709 and C&D tons were 3,475. Total tons for the year 105,684 in MSW and 42,604 in C&D. MSW tons were 6,160 tons higher to prior year and C&D were 3,380 tons higher to prior year. He believes the numbers were higher due to people moving in and doing work on houses and post pandemic closures; the businesses opening back up drove the commercial MSW up. No Revenue line items to note. Total revenue for the month was \$1,645,621. Year-to-date \$18,514,882. Approximately, 1.6 million higher than the prior year which was driven by volume. Expense line items of note: Personnel in the amount of \$321,315 for three payrolls due to year end accrual; Administration Expense in the amount of \$46,376 (\$6,550 for Internal/External Audit and \$4,000 for HydroQuest's report); MRF Operations in the amount of \$20,520 (\$4,649 for baler PM's and \$4,408 for bailing wire); Transfer Station in the amount of \$37,594 (\$23,580 for DEC compliance repairs to UTS

underground tank); and Vehicle and Equipment Maintenance in the amount of \$52,038 (\$25,717 was for trailer 8A sub-frame w/axles). Total operating expenses for the month were \$1,426,100. Year-to-date \$15,524,100. This represents an increase of 1.46 million which was mainly driven by volume, transportation, disposal, and fuel costs. Net operating revenue was \$219,521. Capital Outlay in the amount of \$3,150 for gutters at the MRF and education/bagger building. For the month of December, the fund balance was \$216,371. Year-to-date \$845,560. He stated it was a good year fiscally.

### **MRF Cost Center Analysis**

For the month of December, the total sale of recyclables were \$96,580. Total transport/disposal costs for December were \$5,341. Net revenue of \$91,239. Total personnel expenses were \$35,974. Total operating expenses were \$17,543. Total personnel/operating costs were \$53,517. Net income for the month of December was \$37,722. Year-to-date net income of \$197,379.

**ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS**-None

**OLD/NEW BUSINESS**-None

### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

As the Board was entering Executive Session, Bill Kemble of the Daily Freeman asked what the outcome was in 2018 with the public hearings regarding single stream recycling. Charlie Whittaker, Director of Operations and Compliance stated the Agency never processed single stream. The Agency only received single stream recycling and transported it out (like a transfer station). Bill Kemble asked since single stream recycling wasn't included in the Flow Control law the haulers could bring recycling anywhere? Charlie Whittaker responded that was correct. He stated the Agency has only processed dual stream recycling.

Bill Kemble asked if Tom Kacandes could explain what the Board is asking from the County Legislatures. Tom Kacandes responded that the Board will send out a letter to the Ulster County Legislature which will explain precisely what the Board is asking. He stated that he would suggest the Board to ask the County Legislature in their law, which is outside of the Agency's purview, to consider requiring haulers who are not required to bring recycling to the Agency to collect only dual stream recycling; and to prohibit haulers to not be allowed to collect mixed recyclables. He stated that would be for the consideration and recommendation to the County Legislature.

Katherine Beinkafner moved that the Board go into executive session at 1:04 PM to discuss employee review; seconded by JoAnne Myers. 5 in favor, 0 opposed.

Tom Kacandes motioned to exit executive session and it was seconded by Lisa Mitten at 2:30 PM. 5 in favor, 0 opposed.

Katherine Beinkafner asked if anyone would like to make a motion to increase the salaries for Charlie Whittaker and Tim DeGraff by \$4,500 each, per year, retroactive to the first of the year.

Tom Kacandes made a motion to move to increase the salaries for the Executive Director and Director of Operations and Compliance by \$4,500 each, and observe that in the interest of equity across the range of salary of the various employees of the Agency, recognition of inflation and positive feelings, on behalf of the board, and the increase will be retroactive to January 1<sup>st</sup>. Seconded by JoAnne Myers.

**Roll Call Vote**

**Beinkafner: Aye**

**Myers: Aye**

**Landi: Aye**

**Mitten: Aye**

**Kacandes: Aye**

**5 in favor, 0 opposed-Motion passed.**

Katherine Beinkafner made a note regarding another point that was discussed and stated that there is no action at this time to review the extended contract but will reconsider in a year.

**ADJOURN**

JoAnne Myers motioned to adjourn the January 24, 2022, Regular Board Meeting at 2:35 PM, seconded by Lisa Mitten. 5 in favor, 0 opposed.

February 28, 2022

Motion to approve the above transcribed Minutes of the January 24, 2022 Regular Board Meeting was made by \_\_\_\_\_, moved by \_\_\_\_\_. \_\_\_\_\_ in favor, \_\_\_\_\_ opposed, \_\_\_\_\_ absent.

The minutes were approved by the Board.

Transcribed by: Melinda France, Office Manager. Meetings are recorded and available at [www.ucrra.org/about-us/board-of-directors-meetings-minutes/](http://www.ucrra.org/about-us/board-of-directors-meetings-minutes/).

Signatures:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Katherine Beinkafner, Chair

\_\_\_\_\_  
Ken Gilligan, Secretary

\_\_\_\_\_  
Melinda France, Office Manager